

Levels of basic competencies of the BRAC school graduates of 1995 and 1997

Samir R Nath
Syeda Rumnaz Imam
A Mushtaque R Chowdhury

April 1998

BRAC

Research and Evaluation Division
75 Mohakhali, Dhaka 1212, Bangladesh

Contents

	<i>Page</i>
List of tables	ii
Executive summary	iii
Introduction	1
Objectives	2
Methodology	3
Definition of basic competency	3
The instrument	3
Defining the minimum level of competency	4
The study population	4
Sampling	5
Field operation	6
Training	7
Data quality assessment	7
Results	8
Socio-economic characteristics of the respondents	8
Enrolment situation	10
Performance in basic competencies	12
The 1997 graduates	12
Change in basic competencies	15
Overall change	15
Tracing 1995 graduates	16
Discussion	19
Acknowledgement	22
References	23
Appendices	24

List of Tables

		<i>Page</i>
Table 1	The study sample.	6
Table 2	Percentage of respondents for whom the results of original and post-enumeration interviews matched, by selected indicators.	7
Table 3	Socio-economic characteristics of the sample graduates, 1997.	9
Table 4	Percentage of children currently enrolled in formal school after ten months of graduation from BRAC school by type of school, sex and year of interview.	10
Table 5	Percentage of graduates of 1995 currently enrolled in formal school by type of school, sex and year of interview.	11
Table 6	Percentage of graduates of 1995 who were followed up in 1997 by enrolment status, school type and sex.	12
Table 7	Percentage of graduates satisfying all basic competency criteria by type of school and sex, 1997.	13
Table 8	Percentage of graduates satisfying partial and none of the basic competency criteria by type of school and sex, 1997.	13
Table 9	Percentage of graduates satisfying different basic competency criteria by type of school and sex, 1997.	14
Table 10	Percentage of graduates satisfying all basic competency criteria by type of school, sex and year.	15
Table 11	Percentage of graduates of 1995 who were followed up in 1997 satisfying all basic competency criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.	16
Table 12	Percentage of graduates of 1995 who were followed up in 1997 satisfying different competency criteria in both the surveys by school type and sex.	17
Table 13	Percentage of graduates of 1995 by who were followed up in 1997 basic education competency status and different socio-economic status.	19

Executive Summary

The education programme of BRAC is designed to provide quality basic education to the poor children of Bangladesh. Based on the Declaration of the World Conference on Education, BRAC designed an instrument to measure the level of basic education of Bangladeshi children. The Research and Evaluation Division of BRAC regularly monitors the performance of graduates of BRAC schools through this instrument. This report presents the basic educational and enrolment status of the graduates of two cohorts of 1995 and 1997. Two independent samples were drawn from two cohorts and the learners were tested nine/ten months after their graduation. The sample from 1995 cohort was also tested in 1997. Children from three systems of BRAC schools were assessed: those in Non Formal Primary Education (NFPE) and in Basic Education for Older Children (BEOC) which was directly operated by BRAC, and NFPE under the Education Support Programme (ESP) whom are operated by other NGOs using the BRAC model. The sample sizes for the two independent surveys were 1259 each. Among the 1259 graduates of 1995, 949 could be traced in 1997 (75%).

Enrolment in formal school

- Of the graduates of 1997, around 87% of NFPE and over 75% of BEOC were found currently enrolled in formal schools after ten months of their graduation. For ESP, this rate was 89%. Compared to 1995, the enrolment significantly increased only among the graduates under ESP.
- Among the graduates of 1995 who were followed up in 1997, the enrolment rate significantly deteriorated after two years. Nearly 67% of NFPE, 53% of BEOC and 58% of ESP graduates were found currently enrolled. It may be mentioned that 89% of NFPE, 78% of BEOC and 81% of ESP were found enrolled in 1995.

Basic educational level

The graduates of 1997

- On average, 69.3% of the graduates of 1997 satisfied all four criteria of basic education viz., reading, writing numeracy and life skills knowledge. The performances of the graduates of NFPE and BEOC were statistically equal (respectively 69% and 71.2% of the sample). On the other hand, the graduates of ESP did significantly worse compared to the children of other two groups, only 49% of them passed all four criteria.
- Nearly 30% of the graduates possessed partial basic education and slightly over 1% of the graduates could pass none of the criteria.
- No gender difference was observed in the performance of 1997 graduates.

- Skill wise analysis showed that on average more than 85% of the graduates satisfied the criteria of life, reading and writing skills. However, this rate was 93.5% in the case of numeracy. In all the skills criteria the graduates under ESP did significantly worse than the children in the other two groups.

Overall change: 1995 to 1997

- The basic educational performance of the graduates deteriorated for all three samples of children (on average, from around 75% to 69%) between 1995 and 1997. This deterioration was 73% to 69% in NFPE, 76% to 71% in BEOC and 75% to 49% in ESP. Statistically significant fall was observed in ESP.
- The performance of the graduates of all three groups of children became lower in 1997 than their performance in 1995 in all the four skill areas. However, it is only the ESP whose fall was seen statistically significant in all the four skills.
- In both the surveys (1995 and 1997), the girls of NFPE showed significantly worse performance in numeracy compared to their male peers. In the case of BEOC a similar pattern of gender difference was seen only in 1997. However, the girls of NFPE outperformed boys in writing.

1995 graduates: 1995 to 1997

- Among the graduates of 1995 who were interviewed in 1995 and again traced in 1997, the level of basic competencies increased over two years (71% to 84% for NFPE, 76% to 77% for BEOC and 78% to 83% for ESP). The level of increase was seen statistically significant only among the graduates of NFPE.
- The level of performance increased in all the four areas of the test. However, it was statistically significant in life skills for all the three study groups, and in writing and numeracy only for NFPE.
- Around 64% of the graduates of NFPE and BEOC and 71% of the graduates of NFPE-ESP passed all criteria of basic education in both the surveys.
- Enrolment of the graduates in formal school was found to be an important factor towards sustainability of the level of basic competencies.

Introduction

The World Conference on Education for All (WCEFA) 1990 at Jomtien, Thailand, set a new goal for the developing countries around the world to educate the people of these countries with basic education. As a signatory to the declaration of this conference, Bangladesh is to impart basic education to at least 80% of school-age children by the year 2000 (Primary and Mass Education Division, 1995). In recent years, the government of Bangladesh has committed itself greatly to education. Compulsory primary education was introduced in 1993. Education for girls has been made free up to grade eight. Apart from these public efforts, several non-government organisations (NGOs) have taken up programmes on education for children and adults. BRAC started education programme for children in the mid-1980's with special emphasis on girls' enrolment and provides quality education. There are about 40,000 non-formal centres currently operating in Bangladesh, of which nearly 35,000 are operated by BRAC (Chowdhury et al., 1996; BRAC, 1997).

In the light of the Jomtien conference and with the assistance of UNICEF Dhaka, the Research and Evaluation Division (RED) of BRAC developed an innovative methodology called the Assessment of Basic Competencies (ABC) and conducted a nation-wide study in 1992 to assess and measure the level of basic education of children (11-12 years) of Bangladesh (Chowdhury et al., 1992). The study was repeated using a more refined instrument in 1993 (Nath et al., 1993). The two studies show that the basic competency rate among children was very low, 24.9% in 1992 and 26.7% in 1993.

BRAC operates two models of primary schools for children of two different age groups viz., Non-Formal Primary Education (NFPE) and the Basic Education for Older Children (BEOC). In 1985, the NFPE programme began as a three-year programme for children aged 8-10 years. In 1988, the BEOC (previously known as Primary Education for Older Children or Kishor Kishori) began as a two-year programme for children aged 11-14 years. BEOC was extended to a three-year programme in 1993 and NFPE has been extended to a four-year programme in 1998. Another initiative of BRAC's education

programme is the Education Support Programme (ESP). This programme helps other NGOs to replicate BRAC's model of non-formal primary education in their working areas. BRAC provides technical and financial support to the participating NGOs through the ESP. The BRAC education programme offers a replicable model capable of achieving basic literacy and social awareness among the children of the poorest households. The teaching materials were developed by BRAC to meet the needs of the children (literacy, numeracy, health, ecosystem, community, economy, world and basic science) (BRAC, 1993). The books of BRAC schools are made by BRAC, however the curriculum is broadly based on the government curriculum. The graduates of BRAC schools have the option of continuing their education in formal schools. Most of the BRAC schools are in the rural areas and the goal of all these schools is to enrol at least 70% girls.

Several studies were conducted to assess the level of basic education among the graduates of BRAC's education programme (Nath et al., 1992, 1994 and 1996). Tracer studies were also initiated to evaluate the progress of the graduates, however these studies were based on a small sample size (Nath et al., 1992 and 1994). The study by Nath et al., (1996) is a representative one according to coverage and research strategy. A decision was made to initiate another tracer study of the graduates covered in the 1996 study. This report presents the findings of the latest tracer study.

Objectives

The study aimed to:

1. assess the existing level of basic competencies of the children who graduated from BRAC schools in 1997,
2. assess the variation in the level of basic competencies of the graduates of different BRAC school category broken down by sex,
3. find a change in the level of basic competencies of the graduates of 1995 over a period of two years,

4. find a change in the level of basic competencies of the BRAC's education programme over a period of two years. and
5. assess the changes and variation in enrolment in formal schools of the graduates of BRAC schools.

Methodology

The methodology used in this study was developed in Bangladesh and was used in other studies on Assessment of Basic competencies (ABC) (Chowdhury et al., 1992; Nath et al., 1993). The methodology was developed in consultation with experts from different universities and with organisations at home and abroad.

Definition of basic competency

Considering the definition of 'basic education', 'basic learning needs' and 'learning achievement' by the Inter-Agency Commission of the World Conference on Education for All (WCEFA, 1990), the advisory group of 1992 ABC survey modelled the following definition of 'basic competency' for Bangladesh:

Basic education will refer to education intended to develop basic learning skills (i.e., 3R's) as well as some basic life skills necessary for the children to survive, to improve the quality of their lives and to continue learning.

The instrument to measure basic education

The instrument, designed in accordance with the definition, had four sections: reading, writing, numeracy and life skills/knowledge. A variety of questions were set for each section. The modified instrument used in the 1993 national survey was used in this survey with a total of 42 items (questions).

There were ten questions under 'life skills/knowledge' section. Six of them were on health, one on poultry/livestock, one on population, one on basic attitude about gender, and the last one was on specific knowledge of the outside world.

The 'reading skills' section consisted of three parts. The first part contained five words with different difficulty levels, the second part contained a sentence with five words, and the third part included a comprehension passage which was related to life in Bangladesh and conveyed a development message.

The 'writing skills' section of the instrument had four parts, viz., writing own name and the name of village/town, words, a sentence, and a letter.

There were six parts in the 'numeracy skills' section, viz., counting, reading numbers, writing numbers, addition, subtraction and mental arithmetic. For further details on the design and its modification see: Chowdhury et al., 1992 and Nath et al., 1993.

Information on a number of socio-economic characteristics of the graduates and their parents and households were also collected from parents/guardians.

Defining the minimum level of competency

Children satisfying the following criteria were considered to have 'basic competency', as in all previous surveys:

- a) answering 'correctly' at least seven of the ten life skills questions;
- b) answering 'correctly' at least three of the four questions from the reading comprehensive passage;
- c) 'correctly' communicating a given message through writing a communication letter to his/her father or any relative; and
- d) answering 'correctly' at least three of the four mental arithmetic questions.

The study population

Three groups of children were considered for this study. These are NFPE and BEOC graduates operated by BRAC and NFPE operated under ESP. BRAC-operated schools

are located in the same areas as its rural development programmes (RDP). To obtain the answers to the first two and the fourth objectives of this study, a representative sample of children who graduated at the beginning of 1997 were tested after nine months of their graduation. To achieve the third objective, an attempt was made to trace the graduates of 1995 who were tested by Nath et al., (1996). It can be mentioned that in 1995, a total of 3,993 BRAC schools (NFPE 3,008; BEOC 856; and NFPE-ESP 129) were completed, from which 119,790 students graduated. In 1997, the number of completed schools were 11,552 (NFPE 9,231; BEOC 2,236; and NFPE-ESP 85) from which 3,78,708 students graduated.

The following pages describe sampling, field operation, interviewers' training and data quality of the first round interviews of 1997 graduates and the second round of interviews of 1995 graduates. Detailed information about the first round of interviews of 1995 graduates is available elsewhere. Interested readers are requested to see Nath et al., 1996.

Sampling

The 30 cluster sampling procedure used previously in ABC surveys was used to select the graduates of 1997 for this study. For BRAC operated schools, 30 teams were selected separately for each type of school, applying probability proportional to sizes with systematic sampling techniques. From each team two schools were selected, one at random and one adjacent to the first one. Lists of children who graduated from these schools were compiled from which two separate samples of 7 boys and 7 girls were taken at random. If any problem arose (due to absence of selected respondent in the house, etc.) the interviewers took another school closest to the one they just finished, and repeated the process to complete the remaining interviews. A similar procedure was followed for NFPE and BEOC schools.

For ESP schools, the list of 85 schools completed in 1997 was collected. Thirty schools were selected at random. Another 30 schools were also selected at random among those NGO's from which the first 30 schools were selected. From the graduates of the two schools two separate samples of 7 boys and 7 girls were selected randomly. Thus, around

210 graduates from each of the six groups, totalling 1,259 were covered of the graduates of 1997.

An attempt was also made to trace all the graduates of 1995 interviewed in the study done by Nath et al., (1996) for this study. However, among 1,259 graduates, only 945 could be traced.

Detailed information about the sample size of this study is presented in Table 1.

Table 1 The study sample

	Graduates of 1995			Graduates of 1997 surveyed in 1997
	surveyed in 1995	resurveyed in 1997	% traced in 1997	
NFPE				
Boy	210	164	78.1	211
Girl	210	168	80.0	210
Both	420	332	79.0	421
BEOC				
Boy	207	151	72.9	210
Girl	213	154	72.3	210
Both	420	305	72.6	420
NFPE-ESP				
Boy	191	130	68.1	207
Girl	228	178	78.1	211
Both	419	308	73.5	418
Total	1259	945	75.1	1259

Field operation

The nucleus of data collection was a team of two male persons. While one person conducted the actual interview, the other kept the crowd and the onlookers (children and adults) away. This ensured smoother interviews. There were 10 such teams of interviewers in the survey. Six supervisors ensured data quality. The data collection and the quality control activities were done between November 8 and December 13, 1997.

Training

A four-day training workshop of the interviewers and the supervisors was held in Dhaka. It included classroom discussion, role-play exercises and field operations. A detailed instruction manual was also used. The core researchers of this study conducted the training sessions.

Data quality assessment

There were three different systems of ensuring/checking the quality of data collected. For example, of the two interviewers making up a team, one was made head whose responsibility was to ensure the quality of data collected by the other member. The core researchers of this study carried out random visits to the spots to ensure that the teams were going to the right places and conducting the interviews as per instructions.

Table 2 Percentage of respondents for whom the results of original and post-enumeration interviews matched, by selected indicators.

Indicators	Graduates of 1995		Graduates of 1997 Surveyed in 1997
	Surveyed in 1995*	Re-surveyed in 1997	
Current enrolment status	93.2	94.3	97.2
Place of defecation	95.9	99.0	89.7
Prevention of night blindness	94.5	95.1	88.8
Reading of word 'mother'	100.0	98.1	100.0
Reading of word 'pond'	100.0	97.1	99.0
Reading of word 'freedom'	93.2	97.1	91.6
Question from comprehension passage	97.3	95.1	95.3
Writing own name	100.0	99.0	99.1
Writing the word 'Bangladesh'	94.5	97.2	96.3
Message communication through letter	91.8	95.1	90.7
Counting '40-50'	88.9	98.1	94.4
Reading '49'	95.8	98.1	92.6
A mental arithmetic	91.8	100.0	87.9
n	73	104	107

*Source: Nath & Chowdhury (1996)

A section of the spots covered by each team was randomly selected for post-enumeration check. In each, out of 14 graduates originally surveyed by the team, four were re-

interviewed to check the quality and reliability of the data. Out of 180 spots, 55 were re-interviewed which included 211 interviewed graduates (104 of 1995 and 107 of 1997). This size is nearly 10% of the original sample.

Instead of repeating the whole instrument, information only on selected items were collected. These were then matched with the original interviews to find any deviations. This matching operation showed that the data quality was very good. Most of the items matched in more than 90% of the cases. Table 2 presents the percentages of cases which matched between the two parallel interviews in respect to selected items.

The quality control supervisor found a problem in one spot of an interview team. Instead of conducting the interviews at the residences of the graduates, the team conducted those in the school where the children were currently enrolled. All interviews taken from this spot were discarded and a new spot was selected for fresh interviews.

Results

Socio-economic characteristics of the respondents

The socio-economic characteristics of the interviewed children who graduated in 1997 are presented in Table 3. On average, the mean age of the respondents was 12.4 years. The mean age was highest among the graduates of BEOC followed by NFPE of BRAC and ESP areas respectively. It was found that some children were enrolled in other schools before enrolling in BRAC schools. These children were 12.4% of the total sample. This rate was highest among the boys of BEOC and lowest among the girls of NFPE. After graduating from BRAC schools, 85% of the children enrolled in formal schools for further education. Percentage of graduates enrolled in formal schools was highest among the graduates of NFPE-ESP and lowest among the graduates of BEOC. Nearly three quarters of the mothers' and 56.3% of the fathers' of the respondents never attended any educational institute. Proportionately more illiterate parents were found among the graduates of BEOC.

On average, yearly food security status of more than half of the households from which the graduates came from was reported as deficit. This rate was nearly 60% among the graduates of NFPE-ESP. Nearly 44% of the parents/guardians reported that at least one person within their households sell manual labour for more than 100 days a year. This rate was relatively higher among BEOC graduates and lower among NFPE-ESP graduates. It was observed that about 64% of the households had less than 50 decimals of cultivable land. Persons from households with less than 50 decimals of land and at least one person selling labour for more than 100 days a year were considered eligible for BRAC's development programmes. Only 36.5% of the graduates were found to come from such eligible households. It was observed that at least one person of nearly half of the households were involved with NGO activities. Around 15% of the respondents came from non-Muslim households.

Table 3 Socio-economic characteristics of the sample graduates, 1997.

Socio-economic characteristics	NFPE		BEOC		NFPE-ESP		All (weighted)
	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	
Mean age (in year)	12.1	12.1	13.8	13.9	11.6	11.9	12.4
Current enrolment rate	87.2	87.1	78.3	74.9	90.3	88.2	85.0
Enrolled in other schools before enrolled in BRAC schools (%)	14.2	9.0	25.8	17.5	9.2	8.5	12.4
Mothers never attended school (%)	75.4	71.0	80.4	79.6	71.0	73.0	73.8
Fathers never attended school (%)	56.9	53.8	61.2	63.0	55.6	62.1	56.3
Yearly food security status as deficit (%)	53.1	51.5	59.8	57.8	60.9	58.7	53.3
HHs with <50 decimals of land (%)	62.6	66.2	58.4	58.8	62.8	61.1	63.8
HHs survive on selling manual labour (%)	43.1	43.5	45.5	46.9	35.7	39.2	43.9
BRAC membership eligible HHs* (%)	36.5	36.4	35.9	37.0	29.5	34.0	36.5
HHs with NGO membership (%)	50.5	49.8	47.4	49.0	52.2	50.7	49.7
Non-Muslim (%)	16.1	14.8	15.3	17.5	16.9	19.4	15.5

* Eligible = Households with less than 50 decimals of land and at least one person sell labour more than 100 days in a year; Non-eligible = others.

The socio-economic characteristics of the interviewed children who graduated in 1995 are available in Nath and Chowdhury, 1996.

Enrolment situation

This section gives information about enrolment of the graduates in formal school after completing a three-year curriculum in BRAC schools. Table 4 presents the enrolment rate of the graduates of 1995 and 1997 after ten months of their graduation from BRAC school. It is already mentioned that on average, 85% of the graduates of 1997 were found currently enrolled in formal school. This figure is similar to that when the graduates of 1995 were interviewed in the same duration of ten months. For NFPE and BEOC school children, no statistically significant variations were found in current enrolment rates between the graduates of 1995 and 1997. A similar result was found when data were broken down by sex. On the other hand, among the graduates of NFPE-ESP the current enrolment rate significantly increased from 76.8% to 88.8% ($p < 0.001$). Statistically significant increases in enrolment rates were also observed when data were analysed separately for boys and girls. No gender variation was observed in enrolment rates.

Table 4 Percentage of children currently enrolled in formal school after ten months of graduation from BRAC school by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex		Both (weighted)	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
NFPE				
1995	87.6	87.6	87.6	ns
1997	87.2	87.1	87.1	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
BEOC				
1995	74.9	75.6	75.4	ns
1997	78.6	74.8	75.9	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	75.9	77.2	76.8	ns
1997	90.3	88.2	88.8	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	$p < 0.001$	$p < 0.01$	$p < 0.001$	

ns = not significant at $p = 0.05$

Table 5 presents the enrolment rate of the graduates of 1995 in two different time periods of 1995 and 1997. It was observed that the enrolment rates of all the three groups of children significantly decreased by two years. Decreases in enrolment rates were found statistically significant even if the data were analysed for boys and girls separately. Statistically significant gender differences were noticed only among the NFPE graduates when interviewed in 1997 where girls outnumbered their peer boys. However, this difference was statistically insignificant two years before.

Table 5 Percentage of graduates of 1995 currently enrolled in formal school by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex		Both (weighted)	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
NFPE				
1995	89.0	89.9	89.6	ns
1997	59.1	70.2	66.9	p<0.05
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	
BEOC				
1995	78.8	77.9	78.2	ns
1997	47.7	55.2	53.0	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	77.7	82.6	81.1	ns
1997	57.7	57.9	57.8	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	

ns = not significant at p = 0.05

Among the NFPE graduates of 1995, 65.7% were currently enrolled in both the surveys (Table 6). This rate was 51% and 55% respectively for the graduates of BEOC and NFPE-ESP. Around a quarter of the graduates were currently enrolled in 1995, however, they dropped out from school within the next two years. Some of the graduates were not enrolled in 1995, but were currently enrolled in 1997. Nearly 10% of the graduates of

NFPE, 19.8% of the graduates of BEOC and 16% of the graduates of NFPE-ESP were found currently enrolled in neither of the surveys.

Table 6 Percentage of graduates of 1995 who were followed up in 1997 by enrolment status, school type and sex.

School type	Currently enrolled in both surveys	Currently enrolled in 1997 but not in 1995	Currently enrolled in 1995 but not in 1997	Currently enrolled in neither surveys
NFPE				
Boy	57.9	1.2	31.1	9.8
Girl	69.0	1.2	20.8	8.9
Both	65.7	1.2	23.9	9.2
BEOC				
Boy	45.7	2.0	33.1	19.2
Girl	53.2	1.9	24.7	20.1
Both	51.0	1.9	27.2	19.8
NFPE-ESP				
Boy	54.6	3.1	23.1	19.2
Girl	55.1	2.8	27.5	14.6
Both	55.0	2.9	26.2	16.0

Performance in basic competencies

The 1997 graduates

According to the definition of basic competency used in all previous studies of the same kind, 69.3% of the graduates of 1997 satisfied all four criteria of basic competency (Table 7). Over 70% of the graduates of NFPE and BEOC (operated directly by BRAC) satisfied these criteria. However, no statistically significant difference was observed in the performances between these two groups of children. The performance of the graduates of NFPE under ESP was significantly low compared to the graduates the, of other two groups ($p < 0.001$). Only 49.1% of these children satisfied the criteria of basic education. On average, no statistically significant gender variation was observed in the data. However, girls of NFPE did slightly better than their peer boys and boys of rest of the two study groups did better compared to the girls of the same group. Among the six

groups of respondents, boys of BEOC did best (76.2%) and the girls of NFPE-ESP did worst (48.8%).

Table 7 Percentage of graduates satisfying all basic competency criteria by type of school and sex, 1997.

School type	Sex		Both (weighted)	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
NFPE	66.8	70.0	69.0	ns
BEOC	76.2	69.0	71.2	ns
NFPE-ESP	49.8	48.8	49.1	ns
All (weighted)	68.5	69.7	69.3	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	

ns = not significant at $p = 0.05$

Table 8 Percentage of graduates satisfying partial and none of the basic competency criteria by type of school and sex, 1997.

School type	Partial			None		
	Boy	Girl	Both	Boy	Girl	Both
NFPE	33.2	28.5	29.9	-	1.4	1.1
BEOC	22.9	29.1	27.2	1.0	1.9	1.6
NFPE-ESP	46.4	43.2	44.2	3.9	8.1	6.7
All (weighted)	31.3	28.7	29.5	0.2	1.6	1.2

'Partial basic education' was defined as graduates satisfying at least one of the four criteria but not all. Table 8 shows that nearly 30% of the graduates possess the basic competency criteria partially and slightly over 1% of the respondents could pass none of the criteria.

Performance on each of the four assessment criteria for different study groups of graduates is presented in Table 9. On average, more than 85% of the graduates satisfied the criteria of life skills, reading and writing. However, this rate was 93.5% in the case of

Table 9 Percentage of graduates satisfying different basic competency criteria by type of school and sex, 1997.

School type	Sex		Both (weighted)	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
Life skills				
NFPE	84.4	88.6	87.3	ns
BEOC	88.6	86.2	86.9	ns
NFPE-ESP	68.1	70.1	69.5	ns
All (weighted)	85.1	88.0	87.1	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	
Reading skills				
NFPE	86.3	86.2	86.2	ns
BEOC	91.9	87.1	88.5	ns
NFPE-ESP	75.8	70.6	72.2	ns
All (weighted)	87.3	86.3	86.6	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	
Writing skills				
NFPE	80.6	89.5	86.8	p<0.01
BEOC	84.3	81.4	82.3	ns
NFPE-ESP	69.6	65.9	67.0	ns
All (weighted)	81.2	87.8	85.8	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	
Numeracy skills				
NFPE	97.6	91.4	93.3	p<0.01
BEOC	98.1	93.3	94.7	p<0.05
NFPE-ESP	92.8	87.2	88.9	ns
All (weighted)	97.7	91.7	93.5	p<0.001
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	

ns = not significant at $p = 0.05$

numeracy. In all the skills criteria, the graduates of NFPE under ESP did significantly worse compared to the children of the other two groups. The level of significance of such difference was $p<0.01$ in numeracy and $p<0.001$ in the other three skill areas. Less than 70% of the children of NFPE under ESP passed the criteria of life and writing. No

statistically significant gender variation was found in the performance of life and reading skills. Gender differences were found statistically significant in the writing skills among the NFPE graduates and in numeracy skills among the graduates of BRAC-operated NFPE and BEOC.

Change in basic competencies

This section deals with the variation in the level of basic competencies of the graduates. The first part of the section presents the overall change in basic competency level achieved by the graduates of BRAC's education programme. The second part presents the change in the level of basic competencies of the graduates of 1995 over a period of two years.

Table 10 Percentage of graduates satisfying all basic competency criteria by type of school, sex and year.

Year	Sex		Both (weighted)	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
NFPE				
1995	72.9	72.9	72.9	ns
1997	66.8	70.0	69.0	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
BEOC				
1995	73.4	77.5	76.3	ns
1997	76.2	69.0	71.2	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.05</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	74.9	75.4	75.3	ns
1997	49.8	48.8	49.1	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	

ns = not significant at $p = 0.05$

Overall variation

Two separate samples from the graduates of two different cohorts were analysed in this part. On average, there was no significant change in the level of basic competencies

among the graduates of NFPE and BEOC over two years (Table 10). However, when data were analysed separately for boys and girls it was observed that the basic competency level of the girls of BEOC decreased significantly ($p < 0.05$). Among the graduates of NFPE-ESP, a statistically significant deterioration was observed in the level of basic competencies ($p < 0.001$). In 1997, the performance of the graduates of NFPE-ESP became two thirds of the performance of 1995. This was the case for both boys and girls. The performance of the girls of BEOC significantly decreased because they showed significantly poor performance in life and reading skills in 1997 compared to their performance in 1995 ($p < 0.05$). On the other hand, the performance of the graduates of NFPE-ESP became worse in all the four skills criteria over this period ($p < 0.01$) (Appendix I).

Table 11 Percentage of graduates of 1995 who were followed up in 1997 satisfying all basic competency criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex		Both (weighted)	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
NFPE				
1995	72.6	70.8	71.3	ns
1997	84.1	83.3	83.5	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	$p < 0.05$	$p < 0.01$	$p < 0.001$	
BEOC				
1995	72.2	77.9	76.2	ns
1997	73.5	77.9	76.6	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	ns	ns	ns	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	78.5	77.0	77.5	ns
1997	81.5	83.1	82.6	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	ns	ns	ns	

ns = not significant at $p = 0.05$

Tracing 1995 graduates

This part analyses data on the basic educational performance of the graduates of 1995 who were tested in 1995 and 1997. The level of basic competencies of the NFPE graduates of 1995 significantly increased by two years ($p < 0.001$) (Table 11). Similar

results were found when data were analysed for boys and girls separately. However, no significant change was observed among the graduates of the other two groups of children. The performance of the girls of NFPE increased in the areas of life skills, writing and numeracy (Appendix II). However, for boys the increase occurred only in writing. Although the graduates of BEOC and NFPE-ESP failed to show any increase in the level of basic competencies, they showed significantly better performance in life skills ($p < 0.05$). Children of each of the six groups failed to increase their performance in reading over two years.

Table 12 Percentage of graduates of 1995 who were followed up in 1997 satisfying different competency criteria in both the surveys by school type and sex.

School type	Life skills	Reading skills	Writing skills	Numeracy skills	Basic education
NFPE					
Boy	81.7	87.8	76.8	98.2	64.6
Girl	83.9	82.1	78.6	91.7	63.7
Both	83.2	83.8	78.1	93.7	64.0
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	$p < 0.01$	<i>ns</i>
BEOC					
Boy	85.4	87.4	70.2	96.7	60.9
Girl	89.6	91.6	76.0	93.5	65.6
Both	88.3	90.3	74.3	94.5	64.2
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>
NFPE-ESP					
Boy	83.1	86.2	83.1	96.2	71.5
Girl	83.7	89.9	83.7	93.3	70.8
Both	83.5	88.8	83.5	94.2	71.0
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>

Note: Statistically significant differences were found only between BEOC and NFPE-ESP in writing ($p < 0.01$) and basic education ($p < 0.05$).

Table 12 presents proportion of graduates satisfied all basic education criteria in both the surveys of 1995 and 1997. It was observed that around 64% of the graduates of NFPE and BEOC satisfied all criteria of basic education in both the surveys. This rate was 71% among the graduates of NFPE-ESP. The performance of the graduates under ESP was

found to be significantly higher than the graduates of the other two schools ($p < 0.01$). Skill wise analyses show that over 80% of the graduates of all six groups passed the criteria of life and reading in both the surveys, however, it was over 90% in the case of numeracy. In writing, over 70% of the NFPE and BEOC graduates and over 80% of the graduates under ESP passed the criteria in both the surveys.

Analysis of data showing the proportion of graduates of 1995 by competency status (competent in both surveys, competent in 1997 but not in 1995, competent in 1995 but not in 1997, competent in neither surveys) in basic education and its different components are available in Appendix III.

An attempt was taken to understand the relationship between basic educational competency status and different socio-economic factors of the graduates. The socio-economic factors that were found to be statistically significant determinants of basic education of the graduates of 1995 were chosen for this analysis (Nath et al., 1996). However, sex and mothers' education were also considered in addition to those determinants. It was observed that the graduates of 1995 satisfied the criteria of basic education in both the surveys irrespective of sex, age and mothers' education (Table 13). On the other hand, the graduates who continued education in formal school, whose fathers were educated, who had access to TV and whose households had more than 50 decimals of land were more likely to be competent in all four criteria of basic education in both the surveys. It was also seen that continuation of education in formal schools was the most important factor in this regard. Among the graduates who continued education in formal schools over the last two years, 73.6% satisfied basic education criteria in both the surveys. Otherwise, this rate was nearly 48% among those who did not enrolled in any school after graduating from BRAC schools.

Table 13 Percentage of graduates of 1995 by who were followed up in 1997 basic education competency status and different socio-economic status

Socio-economic status	Competent in both surveys	Competent in 1997 but not in 1995	Competent in 1995 but not in 1997	Competent in neither surveys	Remarks
Sex					
Boy	65.4	14.4	8.8	11.5	
Girl	66.8	14.8	8.4	10.0	ns
Age (in years)					
≤ 10	65.2	18.8	6.3	9.8	
11-12	66.8	14.0	7.8	11.4	
13-14	67.6	13.6	10.0	8.7	
15-18	62.7	14.9	9.0	13.4	ns
Enrolment status					
Enrolled in					
both surveys	73.6	14.5	6.4	5.5	
1997, not in 1995	63.2	21.1	10.5	5.3	
1995, not in 1997	63.2	12.6	12.3	11.9	$\chi^2 = 83.4$
neither surveys	43.7	17.6	9.9	28.9	$p < 0.0001$
Mothers' education					
No schooling	64.3	15.1	9.1	11.5	
Some schooling	71.5	13.2	7.0	8.3	ns
Fathers' education					
No schooling	62.4	16.5	8.4	12.7	$\chi^2 = 10.5$
Some schooling	71.0	12.2	8.8	8.0	$p < 0.02$
Cultivable land					
< 50 decimal	63.2	15.9	8.0	12.9	$\chi^2 = 8.9$
≥ 50 decimal	69.9	13.0	9.3	7.8	$p < 0.05$
Watched TV					
No	58.9	19.0	8.4	13.7	$\chi^2 = 26.7$
Yes	73.0	10.3	8.9	7.8	$p < 0.001$

Discussion

BRAC initiated non-formal primary education programme to give chance to be educated to the children of poor rural families. Children who had never been to school or dropped out from the formal education system are the intended learners of BRAC schools.

BRAC has opened several more schools since 1990. Special emphasis was also placed on quality primary education in the light of the Declaration of the World Conference on Education for All. One of BRAC's education model, known as Kishor Kishori (KK) school, was renamed Basic Education for Older Children (BEOC) to fit with the objectives cited in the World Declaration. At the same time, BRAC also started to emphasise enrolment of graduates in formal schools after completing a three-year non-formal curriculum. The Research and Evaluation Division of BRAC regularly monitors the level of basic education achieved by the graduates of its education programme. Watching the enrolment situation of the graduates in formal school is also a part of this activity.

The findings of this study shows that nearly 70% of the graduates of 1997 had basic level of education, which is 4.5 percentage points less than the performance of the graduates of 1995 when tested with the same duration of 10 months. This indicates overall decrease in the level of basic education over a two-year period. However, this difference was not statistically significant. Comparing this performance with the goal set by the Jomtien Conference it can be said that BRAC's education programme could not meet WCEFA goal of achieving an 80% level of basic education. A question was raised by Nath (1997) on whether the three-year curriculum of BRAC schools can provide the expected level of basic education. In answering this question the same study showed that at least five years of schooling is necessary. Recent extension of BRAC's NFPE from three years to five years might be helpful in this regard.

It was observed that among six groups of children the level of basic education decreased significantly in three groups. These groups are the girls of BEOC and both boys and girls of NFPE under ESP. A statistically significant decrease in the level of basic education in NFPE-ESP school indicates a fall in the overall quality of education in this section of BRAC's education programme. However, a significantly higher proportion of the graduates of this programme enrolled in formal schools for further education, whereas the enrolment rates were statistically similar in both the years among the children of the other two groups. The enrolment situation of the recent cohort of BRAC school graduates

(graduated in 1997) in formal schools is satisfactorily good. However, it is sad that the graduates of the schools under ESP are not doing well in basic competency in recent years. Only about half of the students of ESP could pass all four criteria of basic education. There is a need to look into this issue. ESP schools are managed and supervised by other NGOs. BRAC management can ask the respective NGO management about this matter of poor performance. The quality of both academic and administrative supervision of these schools should be increased. Quality of teacher training should also be assessed and necessary steps should be taken for further improvement.

Like the 1995 survey this study also observed that there was no significant gender variation in the level of basic education and the rate of enrolment in formal schools. This is a good sign for BRAC's education programme. However, this study observed significant gender differences in numeracy among the graduates of both types of BRAC-operated schools. The girls of these two types of schools were found significantly less likely to be competent in numeracy compared to their peer boys. The gender difference in numeracy among the graduates of NFPE was found consistent with the earlier study (Nath & Chowdhury, 1996). This finding is sad and indicates that mathematics is not taught equally to boys and girls in NFPE schools. On the other hand, the boys of NFPE were significantly less likely to be competent in writing skills than the girls of the same group. Gender difference in achievement should be considered as a serious issue. There is a need to explore why discrimination is occurring only in mathematics for a long period. Is there anything wrong in the curriculum or in teachers' attitude that caused this discrimination? Further research is needed to explore this.

Let us look at the performance of the graduates of 1995 when interviewed in 1995 and 1997. The level of basic education significantly increased by two years only among the graduates of NFPE. However, the enrolment rate of all the six groups significantly decreased by this period. As expected, it was observed that further enrolment in formal school increased the level of basic education of the children. The basic educational performances of the graduates of 1995 who continued education for next three years were

much higher compared to the graduates who never enrolled in any formal school. Variation in competency rates due to formal school enrolment was much wider compared to the other socio-economic factors such as parental education, access to electronic media or land ownership of the household. This again indicates two things. Firstly, the three-year curriculum of BRAC schools is not adequate to achieve a satisfactory level of basic education. Secondly, continuation of education for about three years in formal schools also failed to reach the 80% level of basic education, the WCEFA goal. However, we can't deny the need for continuation of education of BRAC school graduates in formal schools. It is not clear why this is happening. Probably the formal schools are not doing its duty properly. Even these schools failed to prevent dropout of the children. Findings of this study further indicate poor quality of educational provision in formal schools.

BRAC is trying to raise basic education level among the poor children in Bangladesh. The level of basic education of the graduates of BRAC schools was found significantly higher compared to the students of formal schools (Nath, 1997). Children do enrol in formal schools after graduating from BRAC schools. BRAC can't reach its intended goals if the formal schools system does not work properly. BRAC's recent effort to run a five-year cycle of primary education may be a very positive initiative for the expansion of basic education in Bangladesh. Even then there is a need to improve the educational quality in formal schools. Joint effort of the government and BRAC might bring better results in education for the children of Bangladesh.

Acknowledgement

The authors are grateful to Dr Sudhir C Sarker and Mr Sunil K. Ghosh for their kind help in providing official information on the programme. We thank the field investigators for their hard-work and the children and their parents for their time. We also thank Ms Amina Rahman and Mr Hasan Shareef Ahmed for editorial support.

Reference

- BRAC (1997): BRAC 1996. Dhaka: Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee.
- BRAC (1993): BRAC Report 1992. Dhaka: Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee.
- Chowdhury, M., Haq, M.N. and Ahmed, Z. (1996): *Quality of primary education in Bangladesh*. Paper presented in the conference of universal primary education in Bangladesh 1996, August 1996. Dhaka: Conference Secretariat.
- Chowdhury, A.M.R., Mohsin, M., and Nath, S.R. (1992): *Assessment of basic competencies of the children in Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee.
- Nath SR (1997): *The impact of BRAC's education programme on raising basic education levels for the children of rural Bangladesh*. An unpublished dissertation submitted to the University of Oxford, UK.
- Nath, S.R. and Chowdhury, A.M.R. (1996): *Basic competencies of the graduates of BRAC schools of 1995*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee.
- Nath, S.R., Khan, M.K.A. and Chowdhury, A.M.R. (1994): *Progress in basic competencies of NFPE and PEOC graduates over time*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee.
- Nath, S.R., Mohsin, M. and Chowdhury, A.M.R. (1993): *Assessment of basic competencies of the children in Bangladesh 1993*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee.
- Nath, S.R., Mohsin, M. and Chowdhury, A.M.R. (1992): *Assessment of basic education of NFPE and PEOC graduates*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee
- Primary and Mass Education Division (1995): *Education for all: National plan of action*. Dhaka: Primary and Mass Education Division, Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.
- WCEFA (1990): World Conference on Education for All: Meeting Learning Needs. Jomtien, Thailand: WCEFA.
- WCEFA (1990): Meeting Basic learning Needs: A Vision for the 1990's. New York: 1990.

Appendix I

Table I.1 Percentage of graduates satisfying life skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex			Level of significance
	Boy	Girl	Both	
NFPE				
1995	84.8	87.1	86.4	ns
1997	84.4	88.6	87.3	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
BEOC				
1995	90.3	92.0	91.5	ns
1997	88.6	86.2	86.9	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.05</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	83.8	86.4	85.6	ns
1997	68.1	70.1	69.5	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	

Table I.2 Percentage of graduates satisfying reading skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex			Level of significance
	Boy	Girl	Both	
NFPE				
1995	91.4	87.6	88.7	ns
1997	86.3	86.2	86.2	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
BEOC				
1995	89.4	94.4	92.9	ns
1997	91.9	87.1	88.5	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.05</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	85.9	89.9	88.7	ns
1997	75.8	70.6	72.2	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	

Table I.3 Percentage of graduates satisfying writing skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex			Level of significance
	Boy	Girl	Both	
NFPE				
1995	83.8	84.3	84.2	ns
1997	80.6	89.5	86.8	p<0.01
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
BEOC				
1995	82.6	86.4	85.3	ns
1997	84.3	81.4	82.3	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	85.3	89.0	87.9	ns
1997	69.6	65.9	67.0	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	

Table I.4 Percentage of graduates satisfying numeracy skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex			Level of significance
	Boy	Girl	Both	
NFPE				
1995	98.1	93.8	95.1	p<0.05
1997	97.6	91.4	93.3	p<0.01
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
BEOC				
1995	98.1	96.7	97.1	ns
1997	98.1	93.3	94.7	p<0.05
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	96.3	95.2	95.5	ns
1997	92.8	87.2	88.9	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	

Table II.1 Percentage of graduates of 1995 satisfying life skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex			Level of significance
	Boy	Girl	Both	
NFPE				
1995	84.1	87.5	86.5	ns
1997	96.3	94.0	94.7	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	<i>p<0.05</i>	<i>p<0.001</i>	
BEOC				
1995	89.4	92.2	91.4	ns
1997	94.0	96.1	95.5	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.05</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	86.2	86.5	86.4	ns
1997	92.3	93.3	93.0	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.05</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	

Table II.2 Percentage of graduates of 1995 satisfying reading skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex			Level of significance
	Boy	Girl	Both	
NFPE				
1995	91.5	86.9	88.3	ns
1997	92.7	92.9	92.8	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
BEOC				
1995	90.1	94.2	93.0	ns
1997	92.1	96.1	94.9	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	89.2	91.6	90.9	ns
1997	93.8	94.9	94.6	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	

Table II.3 Percentage of graduates of 1995 satisfying writing skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex		Both	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
NFPE				
1995	84.1	82.7	83.1	ns
1997	90.2	91.7	91.3	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.05</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	
BEOC				
1995	78.8	89.0	85.7	p<0.05
1997	80.8	81.2	81.1	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	86.9	88.8	88.2	ns
1997	89.2	91.0	90.5	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	

Table II.4 Percentage of graduates of 1995 satisfying numeracy skills criteria by type of school, sex and year of interview.

Year of interview	Sex		Both	Level of significance
	Boy	Girl		
NFPE				
1995	98.8	92.9	94.7	p<0.01
1997	99.4	98.8	99.0	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	<i>p<0.01</i>	
BEOC				
1995	98.0	95.5	96.3	ns
1997	98.7	97.4	97.8	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	
NFPE-ESP				
1995	96.9	96.1	96.3	ns
1997	98.5	95.5	96.4	ns
<i>Level of significance</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	<i>ns</i>	

Table III.1 Percentage of graduates of 1995 by life skills competency status, school type and sex.

School type	Competent in both surveys	Competent in 1997 but not in 1995	Competent in 1995 but not in 1997	Competent in neither surveys
NFPE				
Boy	81.7	14.6	2.4	1.2
Girl	83.9	10.1	3.6	2.4
Both	83.2	11.5	3.2	2.0
BEOC				
Boy	85.4	8.6	4.0	2.0
Girl	89.6	6.5	2.6	1.3
Both	88.3	7.1	3.0	1.5
NFPE-ESP				
Boy	83.1	9.2	3.1	4.6
Girl	83.7	9.6	2.8	3.9
Both	83.5	9.5	2.9	4.1

Table III.2 Percentage of graduates of 1995 by reading skills competency status, school type and sex.

School type	Competent in both surveys	Competent in 1997 but not in 1995	Competent in 1995 but not in 1997	Competent in neither surveys
NFPE				
Boy	87.8	4.9	3.7	3.7
Girl	82.1	10.7	4.8	3.7
Both	83.8	9.0	4.5	3.7
BEOC				
Boy	87.4	4.6	2.6	5.3
Girl	91.6	4.5	2.6	1.3
Both	90.3	4.5	2.6	2.5
NFPE-ESP				
Boy	86.2	7.7	3.1	3.1
Girl	89.9	5.1	1.7	3.4
Both	88.8	5.9	2.1	3.3

Table III.3 Percentage of graduates of 1995 by writing skills competency status, school type and sex.

School type	Competent in both surveys	Competent in 1997 but not in 1995	Competent in 1995 but not in 1997	Competent in neither surveys
NFPE				
Boy	76.8	13.4	7.3	2.4
Girl	78.6	13.1	4.2	4.2
Both	78.1	13.2	5.1	3.7
BEOC				
Boy	70.2	10.6	8.6	10.6
Girl	76.0	5.2	13.0	5.8
Both	74.3	6.8	11.7	7.2
NFPE-ESP				
Boy	83.1	6.2	3.8	6.9
Girl	83.7	7.3	5.1	3.9
Both	83.5	7.0	4.7	4.8

Table III.4 Percentage of graduates of 1995 by numeracy skills competency status, school type and sex.

School type	Competent in both surveys	Competent in 1997 but not in 1995	Competent in 1995 but not in 1997	Competent in neither surveys
NFPE				
Boy	98.2	1.2	0.6	-
Girl	91.7	7.1	1.2	-
Both	93.7	5.3	1.0	-
BEOC				
Boy	96.7	2.0	1.3	-
Girl	93.5	3.9	1.9	0.6
Both	94.5	3.3	1.7	0.4
NFPE-ESP				
Boy	96.2	2.3	0.8	0.8
Girl	93.3	2.2	2.8	1.7
Both	94.2	2.2	2.2	1.4

মৌলিক শিক্ষার স্তরঃ

১৯৯৫ ও ১৯৯৭ সালে ব্র্যাক স্কুলে শিক্ষাসমাপনকারী শিশুদের
উপর একটি জরীপ প্রতিবেদন

সমীর রঞ্জন নাথ

সৈয়দা রশ্মিনাজ ইমাম

আহমদ মোশ্তাক রাজা চৌধুরী

এপ্রিল ১৯৯৮

গবেষণা ও মূল্যায়ন বিভাগ

ব্র্যাক

৭৫ মহাখালী, ঢাকা ১২১২, বাংলাদেশ

সংক্ষিপ্তসার

বাংলাদেশের দরিদ্র শিশুকিশোরদেরকে মান সম্মত মৌলিক শিক্ষা প্রদানের লক্ষ্যে ব্র্যাক প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা কর্মসূচি হাতে নেয় ১৯৮৫ সালে। শিক্ষার উপর ১৯৯০ সালে অনুষ্ঠিত বিশ্ব সম্মেলনের ঘোষণাপত্রের ভিত্তিতে ব্র্যাক ১৯৯২ সালে বাংলাদেশের শিশুদের মৌলিক শিক্ষার মান যাচাইয়ের উপযোগী একটি পরিমাপক উদ্ভাবন করে। উক্ত পরিমাপকের সাহায্যে ব্র্যাক এর গবেষণা ও মূল্যায়ন বিভাগ ব্র্যাক স্কুল থেকে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারী শিশুদের মৌলিক শিক্ষার মান নিয়মিত মনিটর করে আসছে। এই নিবন্ধে ১৯৯৫ ও ১৯৯৭ সালে শিক্ষা সমাপ্তকারী দুই দল শিশুর মৌলিক শিক্ষার স্তর এবং পরবর্তীতে প্রাতিষ্ঠানিক স্কুলে ভর্তি সংক্রান্ত অবস্থা বিশ্লেষণ করা হয়েছে। এলক্ষ্যে দুই দল থেকে দুটি সতন্ত্র নমুনা বাছাই করা হয় এবং শিক্ষা সমাপনের ৯/১০ মাস পর তাদের টেস্ট নেয়া হয়। ১৯৯৫ সালে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারী শিশুদেরকে ১৯৯৭ সালে পুনরায় টেস্ট নেয়া হয়। ব্র্যাক শিক্ষা কার্যক্রমের তিন ধরনের স্কুল থেকে শিশুদের নির্বাচন করা হয় দ্বৈবচয়নের মাধ্যমে। এগুলোর মধ্য প্রথম দুটি হল উপ-আনুষ্ঠানিক প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা (এনএফপিই) ও কিশোর কিশোরীদের মৌলিক শিক্ষা (বিইওসি) যা সরাসরি ব্র্যাক পরিচালনা করে। আর তৃতীয়টি হল শিক্ষা সহায়ক কর্মসূচী (ইএসপি), যার মাধ্যমে অন্যান্য এনজিওরা ব্র্যাক এর এনএফপিই কার্যক্রম পরিচালনা করে। দুটি ভিন্ন ভিন্ন জরিপের প্রতিটিতে ১,২৫৯ জন করে স্কুল সমাপনকারী শিশু নেয়া হয়েছিল। ১৯৯৫ সালের ১,২৫৯ জন শিক্ষা সমাপনকারীদের মধ্য থেকে ১৯৯৭ সালে ৯৪৫ জন অর্থাৎ ৭৫ শতাংশ কে পাওয়া গিয়েছিল।

আনুষ্ঠানিক স্কুলে ভর্তি

১৯৯৭

- ১৯৯৭ সালে যারা শিক্ষা সমাপন করেছে তাদের মধ্যে এনএফপিই'র ৮৭% ও বিইওসি'র ৭৫% শিশু স্কুল সমাপনের দশ মাস পরেও আনুষ্ঠানিক স্কুলে গমন করছে বলে দেখা গেছে। ইএসপি'র ক্ষেত্রে এ হার ৮৯%। ১৯৯৫ এর তুলনায় ইএসপি'র অধীন শিক্ষা সমাপনকারীদের আনুষ্ঠানিক স্কুলে ভর্তির হার উল্লেখযোগ্য ভাবে বৃদ্ধি পেয়েছে।
- ১৯৯৫ সালে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারী যাদেরকে ১৯৯৭ সালে জরিপের আওতাভুক্ত করা হয়েছে তাদের মধ্যে আনুষ্ঠানিক স্কুলে যাওয়ার হার উল্লেখযোগ্য ভাবে হ্রাস পেয়েছে। দেখা গেছে এনএফপিই'র ৬৭%, বিইওসি'র ৫৩% ও ইএসপি'র ৫৮% ব্র্যাক স্কুল সমাপনের তিন বছর পরও স্কুলে যাচ্ছে। উল্লেখ্য যে, ১৯৯৫ সালে এই শিশুদের

मध्ये एनएफपीइ'र ८९%, विईओसि'र ९८% ও ইএসপি'র ৮১% শিক্ষার্থী আনুষ্ঠানিক বিদ্যালয়ে যেতো বলে পাওয়া গিয়েছিল।

মৌলিক শিক্ষার স্তর

১৯৯৭ সালে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারী

- ১৯৯৭ সালে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারীদের মধ্যে ৬৯.৩ শতাংশ ছাত্র-ছাত্রী মৌলিক শিক্ষার চারটি শর্তই যেমন পড়তে পারা, লিখতে পারা, অংক করা ও জীবন দক্ষতা সম্পর্কে জ্ঞান অর্জন করতে পেরেছে। মৌলিক শিক্ষা অর্জনের ক্ষেত্রে এনএফপিই এবং বিইওসি স্কুলের ছেলেমেয়েরা প্রায় একই ধরনের যোগ্যতা দেখিয়েছে (যথাক্রমে ৬৯ ও ৭১.২ শতাংশ)। অন্যদিকে ইএসপি'র ছেলেমেয়েরা অন্য দুটি গ্রুপের ছেলেমেয়েদের তুলনায় বেশ খারাপ করেছে। এদের মাত্র ৪৯ শতাংশ মৌলিক শিক্ষার চারটি শর্তই পূরণ করতে পেরেছে।
- জরিপকৃত ছেলেমেয়েদের প্রায় ৩০ শতাংশ মৌলিক শিক্ষার শর্তগুলো আংশিকভাবে পূরণ করতে পেরেছে এবং এক শতাংশের কিছু বেশী ছেলেমেয়ে কোন শর্তই পূরণ করতে পারেনি।
- ১৯৯৭ সালে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারীদের মধ্যে ছেলে ও মেয়েরা প্রায় সমান যোগ্যতা দেখিয়েছে।
- দক্ষতা বিশ্লেষণে দেখা যায়, গড়ে ৮৫ শতাংশের বেশী ছেলেমেয়ে জীবন দক্ষতা, লেখা ও পাঠ এই তিনটি শর্ত পূরণ করেছে এবং অংকর ক্ষেত্রে এ হার ৯৩.৫%। যোগ্যতার চারটি ক্ষেত্রেই দেখা গেছে, ইএসপি'র ছাত্র-ছাত্রীরা এনএফপিই ও বিইওসি'দের চেয়ে উল্লেখযোগ্য ভাবে খারাপ করেছে।

সার্বিক পরিবর্তনঃ ১৯৯৫ থেকে ১৯৯৭

- তিন ধরনের স্কুলের ছাত্র-ছাত্রীদের ক্ষেত্রেই মৌলিক শিক্ষাগত যোগ্যতার স্তরে অবনতি লক্ষ্য করা গেছে (১৯৯৫ থেকে ১৯৯৭ এ) যা গড়ে ৭৫% থেকে ৬৯%। এই অবনতি'র স্তর এনএফপিই'র ক্ষেত্রে ৭৩% থেকে ৬৯%, বিইওসি'র ক্ষেত্রে ৭৬% থেকে ৭১% এবং ইএসপি'র ক্ষেত্রে ৭৫% থেকে ৪৯%। কেবল মাত্র ইএসপি'র ক্ষেত্রে উল্লেখযোগ্য অবনতি পরিলক্ষিত হয়।
- তিন ধরনের ছাত্র-ছাত্রীদের মধ্যেই ১৯৯৫ এর তুলনায় ১৯৯৭ এ যোগ্যতার চারটি ক্ষেত্রেই অবনতি ঘটেছে। চারটি ক্ষেত্রেই উল্লেখযোগ্য অবনতি পরিলক্ষিত হয় ইএসপি'র ছাত্রছাত্রীদের মাঝে।

- ১৯৯৫ ও ১৯৯৭ সালের উভয় জরিপেই দেখা যায়, গননার ক্ষেত্রে এনএফপিই'র ছাত্রদের চেয়ে ছাত্রীরা উল্লেখযোগ্য ভাবে খারাপ করেছে। ১৯৯৭ সালে বিইওসি'র ক্ষেত্রেও একই ফলাফল দেখা যায়। কিন্তু লেখার ক্ষেত্রে এনএফপিই'র ছেলেদের তুলনায় মেয়েরা ভাল করেছে। অন্য ক্ষেত্রগুলোতে কোন লিঙ্গ বৈষম্য দেখা যায়নি।

১৯৯৫ সালে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারীঃ ১৯৯৫ থেকে ১৯৯৭

- সালে শিক্ষা সমাপনকারী ছাত্র-ছাত্রী যাদের উপর ১৯৯৫ এবং ১৯৯৭ সালে সমীক্ষা চালানো হয়, দু'বছরে তাদের মৌলিক শিক্ষার হার বৃদ্ধি পেয়েছে। (এনএফপিই'র ক্ষেত্রে ৭১ থেকে ৮৪ শতাংশে, বিইওসি'র ক্ষেত্রে ৭৬ থেকে ৭৭ শতাংশে এবং ইএসপি'র ক্ষেত্রে ৭৮ থেকে ৮৩ শতাংশে)। তবে উল্লেখযোগ্য বৃদ্ধির হার পরিলক্ষিত হয় শুধু এনএফপিই'র ক্ষেত্রে।
- টেস্টের চারটি বিষয়েই যোগ্যতার স্তর বৃদ্ধি পেয়েছে। জীবন দক্ষতার ক্ষেত্রে তিনটি গ্রুপের ছাত্র-ছাত্রীরাই খুব ভাল করেছে কিন্তু লেখা ও গননার ক্ষেত্রে বেশি ভাল করেছে শুধু এনএফপিই'র ছাত্র-ছাত্রীরা।
- এনএফপিই ও বিইওসি'র ৬৪% ও ইএসপি'র ৭১% গ্রাজুয়েট উভয় জরিপেই মৌলিক শিক্ষার প্রতিটি বিষয়ে কৃতকার্য হয়েছে।
- ব্র্যাক স্কুলে অর্জনকৃত মৌলিক শিক্ষা'র স্তর টিকিয়ে রাখার ক্ষেত্রে আনুষ্ঠানিক স্কুলে শিক্ষার ধারাবাহিকতা গুরুত্বপূর্ণ উপাদান হিসেবে পরিলক্ষিত হয়েছে।